ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON APPRENTICESHIP (ACA)

**Meeting Minutes**

Location: Denver, Colorado ([Webex recording](https://usdolevents.webex.com/recordingservice/sites/usdolevents/recording/801c080b74c0103bb7bc005056818699/playback))

Date: January 12, 2023

Time: 9:00 a.m. – 4:00 p.m. MST

*9:00 a.m. – 9:45 a.m.*

**CALL TO ORDER**

***John Ladd, Administrator for the Office of Apprenticeship,*** opened the call. Mr. Laddgreeted the ACA members and the public and noted that all meeting materials will be available on www.apprenticeship.gov.

***Dr. Pam Eddinger***, ***ACA Chairperson,*** then conducted the roll call.

**MEMBER ROLL CALL**

*Employer Representatives:*

* Amy Kardel, Senior Vice President of Strategic Workforce Relationships, The Computing Technology Industry Association (CompTIA)
* Carolyn Holmes Lee, Executive Director, The Manufacturing Institute
* Noel Ginsburg, Founder and CEO, CareerWise
* T. David Long, CEO, National Electrical Contractors Association
	+ Delegate: Jared Karbowsky
* Obed D. Louissaint, Chief People Office and Senior Vice President, Aptiv
* Karmela Malone, Senior Vice President of Claims, The Hartford
* Timothy Oberg, Assistant Director, Independent Electrical Contractors
* Valerie S. Richardson, Director, Talent & Workforce Development, Prisma Health

*Labor Representatives:*

* Raymond W. Boyd, Assistant Director of Education and Training, United Association of Journeymen and Apprentices of the Plumbing and Pipe Fitting Industry of the United States and Canada (Virtual)
* Daniel Bustillo, Executive Director of the Healthcare Career Advancement Program, Service Employees International Union
* John A. Costa, International President, Amalgamated Transit Union AFL-CIO/CLC
* Stephanie Harris-Kuiper, Executive Director of the Training & Development Fund District 1199J, American Federation of State County and Municipal Employees (Virtual)
* William K. Irwin Jr., Retired Executive Director, Carpenters International Training Fund (Virtual)
* Michael C. Oathout, Director of Safety & Health, Apprenticeships and Scholarships, International Association of Machinists & Aerospace Workers
* Vicki L. O’Leary, General Organizer and Director of Diversity, Ironworkers International
* Bernadette Oliveira-Rivera, Assistant Director for Training, Laborers’ International Union of North America
* Anton P. Ruesing, Executive Director of the International Finishing Trades Institute, International Union of Painters and Allied Trades
* Todd W. Stafford, Executive Director, Electrical Training ALLIANCE
	+ Delegate: Marty Riesberg

*Public Representatives:*

* Todd Berch, President, National Association of State and Territorial Apprenticeship Directors
	+ Delegate: Josh Laney
* Walter G. Bumphus, PhD, President and CEO, American Association of Community Colleges
	+ Delegate: Jennifer Worth (Virtual)
* Erin E. Johansson, Research Director, Jobs with Justice (Virtual)
* Donna Lenhoff, Principal, Donna Lenhoff Associates, representing Chicago Women in Trades (Virtual)
* Robbie Melton, PhD, Associate Vice President, Tennessee State University, Smart Global Technology Innovation Center
	+ Delegate: Michael Torrence (Virtual)
* Traci R. Scott, Vice President of Workforce Development, National Urban League
* Orrian Willis, Senior Workforce Development Specialist, San Francisco Office of Economic & Workforce Development
* Randi Wolfe, PhD, Executive Director, Early Care & Education Pathways to Success

*Ex Officio Representatives:*

* Johnathan J. Gardner, Director, Human Capital Programs and Chief Learning Officer, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (Absent)
* Amy Peterson, Senior Advisor, Industry Relations, U.S. Department of Energy (Virtual)
* Michael Shapiro, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Economic Policy, U.S. Department of Transportation
	+ Delegate: Paige Shevlin (Virtual)
* Diane Shelly, Regional Administrator, U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development (Virtual)
	+ Delegate: Lacia Sommars (Virtual)
* Kevin Gallagher, Senior Advisor, Upskilling and Broadband, U.S. Department of Commerce (Virtual)
* Amy Loyd, Assistant Secretary, Office of Career, Technical, and Adult Education, U.S. Department of Education
	+ Delegate: Luke Rhine

**WELCOME FROM THE DENVER HOSTS**

*Welcome from President and CEO of Denver Metro Chamber of Commerce, J. J. Ament*

***Ament***: Welcome to Colorado. Employers in Denver and Colorado are excited to hear from you on these topics. We think apprenticeship could be a major tool in filling the thousands of vacant jobs among Colorado employers. In Colorado traditionally, we’d have robust apprenticeship programs in skilled trades, agriculture, livestock, transportation, but what our Chamber members are finding more and more is that the apprenticeships can apply to financial services as well, healthcare, things that we maybe haven’t thought of, technology, HR. The idea that young people can learn and work at the same time and develop the skills that they’re going to need to be successful through apprenticeship programs is something that our team supports.

We’re proud of Colorado’s leadership in this area, in particular Noel Ginsburg and CareerWise. Thank you for the work you’re doing, and we’re delighted to host you!

*Welcome from Noel Ginsburg and Dr. Pam Eddinger*

***Ginsburg:*** Thank you for hosting us – there’s a theme to the people here, it’s a group of people who care deeply about apprenticeship! I appreciate your willingness to come to Colorado. In a few minutes, we’ll hear from the Governor of Colorado and the Attorney General on apprenticeship.

***Eddinger****:* Your folders include today’s agenda and a brief version of what we’ll see on screen. There’s also a set of bios for the members around the table. My role is to be timekeeper – we’re running a tight schedule today, so please be mindful of the time. I will turn this over to John Ladd for an overview of the agenda.

**AGENDA OVERVIEW**

***Ladd***: Thanks to everyone for being here today, and thanks to Noel for the assistance hosting. Looking at this as a model for in-person meetings – going out to see what things are happening across the country together, and ultimately benefitting from the feedback and discussion on the things we see. We’d love to collect your feedback on the site visits and today’s meeting.

*Mr. Ladd ran through the meeting agenda*.

**DEPARTMENTAL REMARKS AND UDPATES**

*Brent Parton, Acting Assistant Secretary, Employment and Training Administration*

***Parton:*** Thanks to everyone for making the meeting possible today. The ACA is a platform for exchange across partners and stakeholders of apprenticeship. That’s why the ACA is structured the way it is, and that is why we want to do big things on apprenticeship during this administration.

It’s also a platform for exchange across Federal agencies and other government partners – thank you to our partners from Education and Commerce who have joined us in person today. This type of coordination will help us realize these huge opportunities.

It’s also a platform for learning. Being on the ground to see apprenticeship programs in person, get out of DC and see things in action, creates a shared learning opportunity. We want to ensure the ACA continues to do that.

Finally, it’s a platform for actual change. The work you all have done, the speed, the depth of the recommendations, is remarkable. We’re working with folks like Secretary Walsh to understand how to make them work.

Funding from recently passed legislation could help facilitate the work we’re trying to accomplish – we need to discuss how to best leverage that investment. The regulatory agenda has now been published, and you may have noticed a mention of a forthcoming rulemaking on apprenticeship. We’re looking at ways to advance your work through that channel as well – you all have been heard, and the work you have put in matters as we work through all the channels available to us. The structure of the subcommittees, the topics, and the work you have put into it matters deeply. The regulatory effort is a big undertaking, and part of that process involves identifying topics for which we want to seek greater public comment and input. The interim recommendations have been critical to push this forward.

We should also view the ACA as a platform for displaying leadership in apprenticeship. The ACA and the information shared and discussed therein is a showcase for leadership in advancing apprenticeship. Colorado has also displayed sustained leadership on apprenticeship – willing to try new things and invest in programs. This state has elevated apprenticeship as a core workforce strategy.

**APPRENTICESHIP COLORADO PERSPECTIVES**

*Phil Weiser, Colorado Attorney General*

***Weiser****:* I want to acknowledge Noel Ginsburg’s contributions here. Noel has been a leader in Colorado for a while and has been passionate about apprenticeship work over his career. He traveled with our former governor, John Hickenlooper, abroad to see how other countries have woven apprenticeship into the fabric of economic society. Noel is not one to shirk from a challenge, so he has been focused on how to make this a national movement in the United States.

Change is hard. CareerWise Colorado has been able to address employment challenges from all sides. Employers have been given an opportunity to transform how they think about their pipeline of potential employees. Educators have been given the opportunity as well. Not everyone is going to be able to pursue a 4-year degree. I believe part of the future of workforce development and opportunity is work-based learning that provides people with certificates demonstrating what they can do.

The youth apprenticeship movement could be a game-changer to extend opportunities to more young people and jobseekers. The work ahead here is significant, and as we think about how we support, challenge, and inspire, Colorado can be a resource. We believe in being innovative – Colorado’s spirit is that we’re willing to try new things. Some strategies may not work, which is okay, shouldn’t stop after just one failed attempt. Principle of youth apprenticeship is so important that leaning in is worth doing. As you build muscle at the state level with federal partnerships, there’s more innovations and more opportunities that have positive second-order effects. We’re thrilled that you’re here with us.

I don’t think there’s a more entrepreneurial, innovative governor in the country. I’m thrilled to introduce Governor Polis!

*Colorado Governor Jared Polis*

***Polis***: We’re excited to have you as our attorney general!

Thank you and welcome! I understand you visited the Cherry Creek Innovation Campus yesterday; that is a great example of vocational candidates today.

We’re excited to foster partnerships between school districts, community colleges, and colleges. We’re working hard to increase our enrollment in community college and attainment of things like associate degrees.

We’re excited about supporting innovative apprenticeship programs across the state. Apprenticeships are important for both employees and employers – they provide employees with the skills they need, and provide employers with a wider pool of qualified workers. There’s an opportunity for apprenticeships to help fill Colorado employers’ vacancies. We’re also excited about a recent bill establishing a state apprenticeship agency.

*9:45 a.m. – 10:00 a.m. Break*

*10:00 a.m. – 10:30 a.m.*

**FACILITATED YOUTH APPRENTICE PANEL**

**Facilitator:** Tway Davis-Clements**,** Apprentice Experience Coordinator, CareerWise Colorado

**Youth Apprentices and Graduates**

* Jacob Pedersen, Advanced Manufacturing Specialist, Cherry Creek Innovation Campus
* Kevin King, Industrial Engineering Technician, Intertech Plastics
* Taliyah Claiborne, Youth Apprentice Project Coordinator, Denver International Airport

***Eddinger***: Next on our agenda is our facilitated youth apprentice panel, with Tway Davis-Clements facilitating. Tway, would you like to introduce your panel?

***Davis-Clements:*** Thanks so much to DOL for inviting us to share our experiences and give apprentices a voice. I’m a former apprentice and alumni of a program, I now work with that program to support its development. I’ll turn it over to our apprentices for their introductions.

***King:*** I started my program as a senior in high school, quickly worked my way up through a program.

***Claiborne:*** I’m currently a senior in high school, and my apprenticeship is at the Denver International Airport.

***Pedersen:*** Started as machinist, moved on to Cherry Creek Innovation.

***Davis-Clements:*** First question for Kevin – why did you think apprenticeship would be a good fit for you?

***King:*** I had support from teachers willing to write me letters of recommendation for programs. I was a well-performing student but professors also sensed that I might not be best suited for a 4-year college program, but recommendations from other contacts saw me end up with Noel at Intertech!

***Davis-Clements*** Jacob, what was your journey like as an apprentice in high school?

***Pedersen:*** I also knew that college wouldn’t be right for me. Moving into my junior year, we had meetings with teachers who gave different answers about college, my engineering professor brought up another option, CareerWise, that changed my trajectory.

***Davis-Clements:*** Taliyah, what were your parents’ thoughts before and after your apprenticeship?

***Claiborne:*** My parents were happy I’d found a job but didn’t know too much about apprenticeship. Working with my counselor, I was able to adjust my school schedule to accommodate an apprenticeship program. My parents are even happier for me and see the program as a great opportunity for my growth.

***Davis-Clements:*** At CareerWise, we do seek to inform parents about our apprenticeship program and what it means for their kids. Kevin, what was your greatest accomplishment as an apprentice?

***King:*** Probably finishing earlier than I was supposed to – I was pulled into the HR office and given an indication that I was ready for the next step. They realized they wanted to elevate me to a more flexible pathway, and I think this was triggered by my performance on the job.

***Davis-Clements:*** Jacob, what caused you to take an interest in teaching?

***Pedersen:*** I’ve been teaching martial arts and was already familiar with a teaching/mentorship role. As I’ve stepped into this role more and more, we have more opportunities to see how participants’ career paths change and the decisions they make for their careers. There’s a great diversity of opportunity in the building!

***Davis-Clements:*** How has your apprenticeship changed your career plan?

***Claiborne:*** My plan has changed a lot. My apprenticeship has helped me learn that I can take my background and experiences anywhere I go. I’m glad to have this experience because I can share how valuable it’s been with other people.

***Davis-Clements:*** Kevin, what are the biggest benefits you anticipated? Now that you’ve been through the program, what are the biggest benefits you see?

***King:*** I think it helped me understand the options available to me outside of the high costs and tuition risk that would be associated with a 4-year college approach. I’ve seen how valuable it is, I’ve had job offers from all over. I see how it has influenced my resume, my LinkedIn profile, it allows companies to see me as an investment and not a risk. CareerWise has a great reputation as well; the credibility has benefited my networking abilities as well.

***Davis-Clements:*** Jacob, what are you seeing from students thinking about their careers?

***Pedersen:*** Having tangible opportunities in front of folks helps. When more students realize that the costs of college may be too high for them, it’s helpful to put tangible opportunities in front of them. There will continue to be a shift, and we’ll have to continue to evolve with our students’ evolving needs and choices.

***Davis-Clements:*** Taliyah, what would you say to someone considering apprenticeship?

***Claiborne:*** Do it! Take the leap and do it if you have interest. It can lead to lots of different places if you take that first leap.

***Davis-Clements:*** Apprenticeship takes people who don’t have much to look forward to and gives them a picture of what the world has to offer them and what they can do.Any questions for our panelists?

***Ginsburg:*** How did you view your future before you took on the apprenticeship?

***Davis-Clements:*** Where I grew up, there weren’t a lot of options, and the options people around me did take weren’t ideal. The mentorship and support from colleagues at CareerWise changed my outlook on the pathways and options available to me. Now we’re moderating panels, we’re speaking at events, we’re in jobs that used to “require” 4-year degrees. I have had so many opportunities for myself and chances to inspire others.

***Louissaint:*** When you first heard the term apprentice and apprenticeship, what were your immediate thoughts?

***King:*** I wasn’t expecting how much would be hands-on, reading technical manuals, receiving technical and other education, how many soft skills I would get.

***Oliveira-Rivera:*** Congrats to all of you on the panel, it takes a huge amount of courage to join a program if it’s a foreign concept. Is there something that was challenging for anyone on the panel – anything you wish you could change?

***King:*** They give you as much support as you need. I probably needed less involvement from supervisors, I bristled against things like workshops and other events. I may have benefited from being presented the full plan – the full set, the entire pathway – if I would have been given that from the outset, I might have benefited from that.

***Willis:*** I hate public speaking and I’m almost 40! You guys are doing an incredible job speaking here, and we appreciate you guys being trailblazers. Are there more people coming behind you and following your lead?

***Claiborne:*** Yes, I believe it is, and I believe it’s getting more attention. I know a few of my friends and classmates were surprised when they’ve learned I work at the airport as an 18-year-old. I always like to brag about the experience to others because I know where the experience could take me.

***King:*** I second that answer, and I’ll say that my family has also engaged in this! My mom and sister, for example, are constantly bringing it up. My roommate got into my program because of conversations like this.

***Richardson:*** Where else should we be looking, outside of schools?

***Davis-Clements:*** Definitely schools, but also look at community events and try to get on the dockets there. Boys and Girls Clubs have the right type of audience. Be there at community outreach events to explain what apprenticeship is, explain its value, and increase awareness. Walmart, Target, Safeway – consider setting up a table.

***King:*** First Robotics is another more specific example. I’ve seen apprenticeship programs where the participants recognize each other from that setting.

***Eddinger:*** I’m struck by the professional demeanor and emotional intelligence on display here. I would urge our members to remember these professionals when thinking of great examples of a successful program!

***Ginsburg:*** Any thoughts from one of our panelists’ mothers in the audience?

***Mrs. Pedersen:*** I’m Jacob’s mother. The beauty of this opportunity is that it’s changed our family’s dynamic. We’ve always known that Jacob was a brilliant person who wasn’t necessarily well-equipped for the 4-year college path. The moment Jacob had the apprenticeship, he’s gone forward with a real purpose and has a goal to find his place at the table and share his experiences with others. It can be a real life-changing opportunity.

*10:30 a.m. – 12:00 p.m.*

**YOUTH APPRENTICESHIP DISCUSSION AND DIALOGUE**

**Overview of Current State of Youth Apprenticeship in the United States**

**Facilitator:** Megan Baird, Deputy Administrator, Office of Apprenticeship, Employment and Training Administration

***Baird***: Before I hand this over to Noel as the facilitator for this discussion, I wanted to provide a little background on the current state of youth apprenticeship.

We’re sharing a pre-clearance version of a white paper on this topic, as well as the options multiplier white paper that has been published.

*Ms. Baird presented information from the meeting slides on youth apprenticeship.*

Options multiplier; prevalence of programs within secondary school system; mix of registered and non-registered programs; different state approaches to the model (only 20 states have a formal definition); no national definition, no national system for oversight, limited knowledge about youth apprenticeship outcomes (particularly non-registered); typically involve more partners than adult programs, including local colleges, dual-enrollment programs, colleges as RTI provider, wrap-around services.

Youth apprenticeship models: secondary school-based, postsecondary school-based, intermediary, regionally coordinated, youth-supporting mixed-age.

Data and demographics on youth apprenticeship – interest in youth apprenticeship has grown steadily over time.

Data and demographic information on active youth apprentices: of more than 576,000 apprentices, 39% are 16-24; 68% of youth apprentices are white, 17% did not identify, 9% black; 86% male, 13% female.

Top occupations for youth apprentices are skilled trades, mirroring data at the national level.

**ACA Members Feedback and Open Dialogue – Youth Apprenticeship**

**Facilitator:** Noel Ginsburg, Founder/CEO, CareerWise, Employer Co-Chair

***Wolfe:*** Can we go back a slide – are you saying the demographic numbers on active youth apprentices is reflective of the general population?

***Ginsburg:*** These numbers represent traditional out-of-school youth apprenticeship, when it’s in-school youth that start in high school the numbers change dramatically. As a foundational strategy it’s an equity strategy.

***Malone:*** When the numbers shift dramatically, for the 9% African American active youth apprentices, when looking at the high school population that number is much greater?

***Ginsburg:*** It changes, it depends on the school you’re recruiting out of. The students that came out of the polled school reflected that.

***Bustillo:*** Of that total of 200,000-something youth apprentices, what’s the total number for what you’re describing?

***Ginsburg:*** I don’t know, it’s fractional.

***Louissaint:*** The data doesn’t reflect the Census population and the overall population, though! We need to be more intentional in reflecting that.

***Parton:*** There are things we can’t count…these are youth engaged in a program we can count.

***Lee:***In addition to the ethnicity distribution for school-based programs, does the gender balance also improve?

***Ginsburg:*** Yes, it does.

***Lee:*** Is there a wide distribution of occupations for the rest of the youth apprentices not shown on the “Top 10 Occupations for Youth Apprentices” slide?

***Ginsburg:*** Data is heavily weighted to traditional occupations for apprentices.

***Lenhoff:*** It seems to me the slide showing the different approaches highlights one of the diversity problems – if it’s a secondary school-based apprenticeship, you’re not going to get out-of-school youth, and you’re going to also have an impact from segregated school districts. So, I’m wondering if this suggests different data-gathering is needed? Encouraging, discouraging, or changing the approach, combining school districts from different backgrounds?

***Harris-Kuiper:*** My concern is looking at demographics for the 68% of youth apprentices who are white, where are the breakdowns for the other ethnicity demographics?

***Kardel:***The elephant in the room is how do we share access opportunity across all demographics?

***Eddinger:*** In some ways this speaks to how to incentivize the system to take care of a population that is previously left behind. Speaks to the work of the DEIA committee.

***Ginsburg:*** Donna’s question regarding school districts is very important. In this work we have to be intentional on all this stuff as this gives currency to any district that’s participating. Where we recruit and where we build pathways are really important so that we don’t hold up opportunities like in the past. We must make sure these opportunities are reflective of our communities. We must fight against only recruiting from school districts where students tend to do better as apprentices. Apprenticeship can accelerate academic achievement for all participating in it.

***Oliveira-Rivera:*** I want to acknowledge the work that needs to happen across the board to make sure everyone has access to apprenticeship. We’re already doing some amazing work, sometime seems like it’s daunting to get where we want to be. Participation of young people in registered apprenticeship has increased. I also want to bring up the issue of why 18 years of age is sort of a marker, that’s a point this committee probably will have to think about. Many of us have strong feelings about safety, the protection and well-being of anyone who gains access to a jobsite. There are child labor laws that are very near and dear to many of us who are a part of the system. And so for a lot of programs, in the building trades in particular, 18 years of age is a requirement to gain access. That’s for their own safety as well as philosophically.

***Wolfe:***The age range of 16-24 maybe isn’t the best framework. A 16-year-old is very different from a 23-year-old.

***Eddinger:*** We need a more useful profiling of the sociopsychological state a person is in. This will change the way we recruit. This is very important.

***Ginsburg:*** Other ways to disaggregate the data?

***Bustillo:*** Very important to disaggregate by sector as well. We need longitudinal data on the trajectory of these programs, we don’t want to proliferate programs in lower paying occupations.

***Ginsburg:*** We shouldn’t be encouraging the use of the term apprenticeship for such terminal occupations. They need to lead to occupations with a living wage. We need to explain what policy we recommend on this point.

***Scott:*** We’re talking about a youth referral ecosystem for apprenticeships. First point is that we must think more globally about everything. If you have in-school youth and out-of-school youth, you have those that are attached to institutions, community based or school, while some are not attached to either, such as foster care youth who have aged out and homeless youth. In the ecosystem, there is an opportunity to ensure we are including them in this conversation. Second point is that we have been talking about access. We said that peer-to-peer referral is strongest way to connect, however if it’s a minor percentage who represent BIPOC that are even involved, then we’ll have continued problems in workforce development. Need to add access and awareness. Third point is that youth should be on this panel itself telling us what works for them and their peers.

***Pedersen:*** Our Cherry Creek school’s demographic poll more or less reflected our school district’s numbers across race and gender. It takes a more concerted effort, getting buses to schools, being purposeful.

***Lee:*** Thanks again to the panel, and we can learn a lot about the diversity of experience. We should look at all the barriers we heard about – Kevin was an AP student, but just didn’t like it, and benefitted from understanding the other opportunities available. We don’t want to inadvertently create too rigid pathways.

***Ginsburg:*** We should emphasize this – the saying we heard overseas was that you could start with an apprenticeship and end up with a PhD. The narrative should also include the fact that you can do both – the work-based learning and the educational pathway.

***Louissaint:*** Case study at my previous company at IBM. Program where students started P Tech early in high school. Started in internships, transitioned to pre-apprenticeship, then went on to monitored apprenticeships; 78% of them went on to complete and get a bachelor’s degree, 90% of the population being Hispanic or African American in underserved communities. When intentional about the way it’s being communicated, marketed, and branded, then apprenticeship is a pathway.

***Ginsburg:*** Let’s also hear from Dr. Loyd from the Department of Education – what have you learned, what is your reaction to this discussion and the panel we heard from, and what do you see as the opportunities from youth apprenticeship.

***Loyd:*** Seeking to reshape the mindset among teachers about apprenticeship.

***Huckaby:*** Reminder to speak up in the room.

***Ginsburg:*** Switzerland has a very good apprentice system, we can learn from them. Their system is much smaller than ours though. Using registered apprenticeship as a strategy to become a meaningful part of our education system. What should we make recommendations on for apprenticeship based on what we’ve seen?

***Costa:*** Sitting and learning in class wasn’t for me. Back then options were office jobs, not trade jobs. At 18 I got a New Jersey Transit job in the light rail division. Member of a union and later became an international president of one of the largest transportation unions in North America. Apprentice programs work and are a way to keep young people who don’t like sitting in class away from trouble and into a career that’s much cheaper than college. How we establish this in our schools is important in terms of the demographics of and type of trade taken up by apprentices.

***O’Leary:*** Construction workforce is most educated we’ve ever had as they went to college first and then came back to us to make the kind of money they’re making today. What they’re taking in their apprenticeship is going to go to a post-secondary education.

***Oliveira-Rivera:*** What struck me about the tours yesterday was the effort put in to providing young people the ability to explore careers and fields they wouldn’t normally be connected to. How do you begin to enable showing people at a young age what it would be like to work in a specific sector? Experiential learning is key to success. Struck by how important it is that kids got to understand the various job sectors and move freely in exploring them. Dignity in all this work. How do we set up a system that emulates some of these best practices that are clearly working?

***Ginsburg:*** Very important point. In the Swiss system, students in middle school start with sniffing, which is basically a micro internship. Their workforce centers facilitate this, something we could do in the U.S.

***Lenhoff:*** I would like to get feedback on regulatory requirements – Registered Apprenticeship has certain requirements in the CFR. What requirements should apply to youth?

***Ginsburg:*** We heard yesterday that the registered system can be difficult – they don’t know about underwriting, differences in what they anticipate vs. where they end up, some programs may not fit well with the registered apprenticeship model. There was pain in their voice in explaining this, and we should listen to that. I don’t think we need a separate system – in-school youth can be apprenticeship plus, with supports and flexibilities for new occupations that were previously not apprenticeable. We live in a country of local control – I don’t think it’s a separate system, but I do think thinking of it as apprenticeship plus is useful. We’re trying to address this with recommendations in our group.

***Costa:*** In our industry, we learned how to market the registered system. The money allocated to programs has interested authorities once they get past the stigma of dealing with a union. We’re actually finding partnerships with the registered system helpful.

***Ruesing:*** The program we saw yesterday seems more like a pre-apprenticeship than an apprenticeship. It helps people think about what job they want to pursue, and then they can move into a registered program. I think apprenticeship programs need to include employment – when someone completes an apprenticeship program, but then has to interview for a job, that doesn’t look like an apprenticeship program to me. We still seem to talk a lot about college as the next step after apprenticeship – it’s then not an equal pathway! If someone is a first-year employee, are the wages the same between apprenticeship graduates and those with college degrees? We want to frame apprenticeship as an equal pathway. I don’t think college should be required for apprenticeship graduates to become high-level employees.

***Ginsburg:*** We have to stop the narrative of college for all. Businesses have to see the value of apprenticeship or these will be good ideas that go nowhere.

***Eddinger:*** What we saw at Pinnacol was more of an industry-based pathway – you go in to try to better understand pathways within an industry. Then I also look at the panel in front of me – you’ve got 40 more years to work. Are you going to be in that same job? If you look for a next job, what is going to take you there? I saw beginnings for these conversations on the site visits. We need to get away from framing apprenticeship as an alternative to something. It’s a choice, a valid choice – it’s not an alternative to college, either. For how we define the next iteration of apprenticeship, we may have to redefine our own language.

***Lee:*** How we measure things matters – if we only track how many students go on to college, we won’t move past some of these issues.

***Malone:*** Still feel like these conversations get weighted toward the skilled trades. Financial services and other sectors are important targets for apprenticeship growth. I saw folks at Pinnacol learning transferable skills – they’ll be able to apply for jobs at other insurance companies across the country. That’s a type of career pathway. I want to see the data on conversion rates for people of color, for how many people we convert to become interested in apprenticeships.

***Laney:*** Flexibility to move between paths is key. It’s the tension with the normal registered apprenticeship program. We need to be clear on the definitions of these programs, or Megan will never be able to provide accurate data on the extent of youth programs and participation. Where I’m from, we do refer to apprenticeship as post-secondary education. Reports on the value of college scholarships handed out don’t necessarily help things. We need ways to measure this that gives school counselors, parents, etc. a better understanding of the value.

***Harris-Kuiper:*** We’ve linked with YouthBuild, who have HHA programs and home health aides, we then work with them in our CNA program. Our CNA program is linked with hospitals and nursing homes because we’re union based. How are our pre-apprenticeship programs linked to our apprenticeship programs? If we just have an HHA program with no linkages anywhere we’re setting up our youth for failure as it’s a dead-end role. Part of the key is looking at the pathways and the structure of the programs that are funded from state to state. Mentorship with our black and brown students is also key.

***Wolfe:*** Back to Donna’s initial question – from our experience, an advantage to being early adopters of the youth apprenticeship grants was that we can start to define it. Registered Apprenticeship requires at least 2,000 hours of on-the-job training, and school aren’t always set up to allow students to go off campus. So, then we decided to call them pre-apprenticeships – a pathway to an apprenticeship. There’s no such thing as a youth apprenticeship. There are apprenticeships where participants are youth. Allowing pre-apprenticeship participants to accumulate some hours, certificates, etc. and then transfer into apprenticeships with some experience does work. There’s no reason to create a new system. The key barrier is the structure of high school, the scheduling of classes, the reluctance to promote apprenticeship among counselors.

***Loyd:*** We would love to reimagine the framework so that students could spend more time in the workplace.

***Wolfe:*** We’re trying to pilot these models for breaking down the educational guardrails around school frameworks and allow more flexibility and more choices.

***Ginsburg***: Some key points I heard:

* Importance of definitions.
* Credit for higher learning can be valuable.
* Career exploration is valuable.
* Marketing around the value of apprenticeship.
* What’s the right data to measure?
* Maintain DEIA focus.

I encourage us to listen to what employers are saying. Want apprentices to know every department so that when they finally complete their apprenticeship they know the business. Apprenticeships have to fit the criteria and how we define it here is critically important.

*12:00 p.m. – 1:30 p.m. – Lunch Break*

*1:30 p.m. – 3:00 p.m.*

**SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUTS: PROPOSED STRATEGIC FRAMEWORK STATEMENTS AND ISSUE PAPER TOPICS**

**Industry Engagement in New and Emerging Sectors (IENES) subcommittee**

***Willis:*** I have the honor of representing the IENES group. We’re not knocking the existing system; we know that system works for sectors and occupations that have well established programs. For Registered Apprenticeships in new and emerging occupations, we do have proof of concept, but it will take equivalent resources, processes, and a systematic approach similar to those in established registered apprenticeship structures for it to meet our country’s RA expansion goals.

One challenge in engaging new sectors is the lack of qualification frameworks to get buy-in from industries and institutions. The opportunity cost can’t be overstated – conservatively estimated at $13 billion per year. It’s not just funding, but we need to leverage new investments.

I’ll hand it over to Amy Kardel.

***Kardel:*** We’ve broken out into four sub-subcommittees: branding and perception, incentives, standards and system-building, and sector-specific differences. The push for an equitable approach to apprenticeship expansion is key to our vision. We’re up against change, which can be hard to overcome (we heard this from the Colorado AG). It’s a process disruption that may end up taking power away from some and giving power to others. We also have thought about this as an ecosystem that is inclusive.

***Wolfe:*** Of course, I’ll speak from the early childhood education (ECE) perspective. We propose an issue paper topic around quality apprenticeship programs for lower paying occupations that put participants on a pathway to higher paying careers. Experience has demonstrated that without structure and supports, women, people of color, immigrants, and other marginalized groups will miss out on opportunities.

*Dr. Wolfe provided an overview of demographics/statistics about ECE.*

What is necessary to create successful apprenticeships in essential industries? What policy changes or investments are needed to do so?

***Malone:*** How are you thinking of your issue papers in terms of DEIA representation?

***Wolfe:*** We have stories to tell about our people – who do come from the underrepresented groups that we want to target from the DEIA perspective – and the successes they’ve had in obtaining degrees. Part of the goal is to use apprenticeship to address that issue.

***Malone:*** From a wage perspective, as you think about that sustainable piece, you don’t see that as a particular issue as well?

***Wolfe:*** We’re only going to go so far if we don’t change the bigger context. As you move up, you won’t receive great salaries, but you won’t make minimum wage. $58,000 average salary nationally, and in some places like California it’s tens of thousands of dollars higher.

***Willis:*** I can speak to the programs I oversee. Members are exceptionally into the larger number of the registered apprenticeship system. We’re capturing on average more diversity in new and emerging sector apprenticeships.

***Kardel:*** Piggybacking on what Orrian said, many of the incentives are aligned with the 50% minimum diversity requirement to fund those contracts to move forward with emerging sector expansion.

***Richardson:*** Speaking on the industry partners perspective, to get industry partners engaged, a lot of the time they want to know what their financial responsibility is to the apprentice. Some of the challenges we run into is for a particular funding grant for a program, is there a limit for a participant for a program for compensation? Are there any OA restrictions if you’re trying to create a ladder?

**Apprenticeship Pathways subcommittee**

***Oberg***: Inclusion of employers, teachers, and the youth themselves in the development of models. We know the value of the investments, and we know it provides apprentices with the skills to proceed in a career.

***Karbowsky:*** How do we make adjustments to the registered system to create a youth approach? Any special considerations with respect to employment laws, privacy, child labor, other state laws? Using youth to promote DEIA outcomes. How to best align curricula and coursework with employers’ needs? Identifying occupations that would be particularly suitable for youth apprenticeship programs.

***Ginsburg:*** In addition to Labor and Education, we should include Commerce. And we shouldn’t disregard the balance over the lifetime of the workforce, and look at age discrimination with respect to older workers as well.

***Karbowsky:*** We want granular detail on the differences between youth and pre-apprenticeship.

***Ladd:*** There was also an intentional emphasis on youth because there was an emphasis on pre-apprenticeship for the last few meetings.

***Ginsburg:*** The standards that Registered Apprenticeship includes are important, the transferable credential is an important standard from that model.

***Lee:*** Industry buy-in is critical, and industry voices may be useful for that work around developing the standards.

***Ruesing:*** We also need to have the conversation about funding – where is the money going to come from? There needs to be a model for funding and sustainability beyond grants – life after grants – maybe associations or conglomerations of employers can help? Grant money isn’t always going to be there.

***Lenhoff:*** I agree with Anton’s comments about funding for sure. I also want to make the point that another difference between Registered Apprenticeship and non-registered are the requirements for DEIA for registered – we don’t have that guarantee or that standard in non-registered programs. I don’t think the interim report answered all the questions – I think it raised some good questions.

***Eddinger:*** As we talk about the nomenclature, we should think about defining these elements. It can only be successful if it’s supported by the other supports that may not be part of a registered program.

***Oliveira-Rivera:*** A lot of the things we’re talking about here may not actually be registered apprenticeship, may instead be another part of what workforce development is. We should consider defining these certain things.

***Oberg:*** All apprenticeships need to result in employment.

***Willis:*** We spend 180 times more money on preparing people for and supporting people through apprenticeship than is spent on workforce development.

**Apprenticeship Modernization subcommittee**

***Riesberg:*** OA should consider these three perspectives: the apprentice, the employer, and the market. For the apprentice, the focus should be on quality. For employers, the on-ramp and the ease to starting a program. And finally, for the market, how do we get past the old terminology and enhance willingness to frame apprenticeships as a viable career path, and not an alternative to other?

Good programs for the participant – DEIA outcomes, variable outcomes, and the ability to move a little bit within programs. A level of transparency to the apprentice. Having a voice at the table, being able to voice their experience and provide the apprentice’s perspective. Compliance regarding safety and ratios (hot-button issue) – it all should come down to the safety of the participant. Different ratios in IT vs. construction.

***Louissaint:*** For the employer population: (1) clarity with the standards, consistency among the federal and state levels; (2) leverage industry associations and coalitions; (3) apprenticeship model as a vehicle that connects to things employers really care about and are invested in – integrate into employers’ talent management systems. Tactical considerations as well include the challenges of Form 671 (particularly in bulk). There have been improvements in RAPIDS but it doesn’t live up to its name yet.

***Oberg:*** We also need real concerted efforts around advertising!

***Johansson:*** Preference in bidding and real carrots to encourage programs to meet higher level standards.

**Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Accessibility (DEIA) subcommittee**

***Scott:*** Embed DEIA in all aspects of registered apprenticeship (no harassment, discrimination, etc.).

***O’Leary:*** Leading indicators to proactively identify and address issues: culture, diversity, change, place-based strategies. I’m a journeyman ironworker and I refer to that as a status, not a gendered statement – I earned that. Studies have shown women have not left jobs in the trades because the work was too hard, it was because of how they are treated.

*Ms. O’Leary shared the story of a female ironworker killed on the job by a male coworker.*

We work in challenging places, but women weren’t intimidated by the job or the workplace, they were scared of treatment by others, harassment, safety concerns, etc.

***Scott:*** The word “proactive” in our statement is critical. These concerns often arrive at overseers’ desks too late.

***Bustillo:*** What we envision for Registered Apprenticeship is utilization of the model to address occupational segregation in higher wage occupations. It does us no good in health care to focus on lower wage occupations; we really need to do the work on occupational segregation in occupations that are affected by that.

***Oliveira-Rivera:*** As we think about job skills we offer apprentices, we should consider DEIA on the job as well. Train workers in how to be good allies, how to identify unconscious biases, maybe something to think about as a skill to train folks in.

***Ginsburg:*** Developing and training supervisors and coaches is also important. How can we build in trainings on DEIA for both the apprentices and everyone else?

***O’Leary:*** Until we address the reporting mechanisms, the problems will continue. There are still elements that make women afraid to speak up.

***Lenhoff:*** There is a requirement in the regulations that programs provide anti-harassment training (not just on gender, but race, disability, etc.). We do have a basis for that – the required training is minimal, maybe we can look at that. Because it is so hard to make complaints, it is incumbent upon the systems to look at the data. I would generally urge all the subcommittees to use existing data, and also think about other data you might need to anticipate this and other types of problems.

***Richardson:*** I’m glad Donna brought up the required trainings in the CFR – feedback I hear is that people want to know who they should go to in order to express concerns, what people are involved in the safe space for this type of feedback.

***Louissaint:*** Building on some of these comments, I’m a huge advocate of learning, and training and education are hugely important. But establishing the training isn’t the whole deal – it doesn’t matter what you say in the training, if the foreman who is a jerk is the one that gets elevated. Who do you reward? What signals are you sending in elevating a certain person.

***Eddinger:*** I also hope this group considers the concrete elements of wrap-around services. What kind of services do you need to put forward and fund?

**Ex Officio Workgroup**

*Mike Qualter, Deputy Administrator, Office of Apprenticeship, Employment and Training Administration*

***Qualter***: I’m online and will quickly turn it over to the federal agency partners for some report-outs – I’m very proud of the connections and contributions we’ve gotten through this group. Our federal agency partners have been committed to this work and successful in moving a lot of initiatives forward that are inclusive of Registered Apprenticeship and the goals that we’re trying to succeed in with this administration.

*Updates from Ms. Loyd (Education), Mr. Gallagher (Commerce), Ms. Shevlin (Transportation), Ms. Sommars (Housing and Urban Development), and Ms. Peterson (Energy).*

***Loyd:*** I have three updates to share from Education. The first is that in the omnibus spending bill Congress passed, we have $25 million this fiscal year to build out new career-enhancing high school programs that bring together higher education, businesses, and industry around work-based learning, industry credentials, career and college advising, and earning dual credit while still in high school. The second is that next month, which is CTE Month, we’re releasing a memo to state directors of career and technical education with specific guidance on the linkages between Perkins V – the federal funding for career and technical education – and Registered Apprenticeship. The third is I want to make a plug for – and I appreciate the DEIA subcommittee mentioning this – thinking about the brilliant, resilient, untapped workforce that’s out there and some of the upskill/reskill conversations we’ve had, adult education for adults without a high school credential or with low levels of literacy and numeracy, immigrants who may have incredible experience and expertise but need to get a foothold here in our country, incarcerated and justice-involved members of our community, etc.

***Gallagher:*** Since my last report to the group, focused on Commerce’s internet for all programs and how broadband funding in the infrastructure law created an incredible opportunity for us to grow registered apprenticeships, Congress passed the CHIPS and Science Act containing more than $50 billion to dramatically support and grow the U.S. semiconductor industry. That money will be used to incentivize the construction of new semiconductor production facilities, both for legacy chips used in appliances and cars and leading-edge chips used in quantum computing and integral to national security. We view this as an incredible opportunity to grow Registered Apprenticeship in at least two meaningful ways: first, construction of these facilities, which are enormous and take years to build, and we view implementation of that as a way for us to help make sure that as registered apprenticeship opportunities in trades increase they are specifically targeted to groups that have not traditionally had as much presence, namely women and people of color; and second, there’s a great opportunity in the facilities for a significant number of roles around advanced manufacturing – we’re seeing some initial growth of registered apprenticeships in the industry, the efforts are new and growing.

***Shevlin:*** First off, on the construction side, most of Transportation’s competitive grants have a preference for programs that are using Registered Apprenticeship – we have a whole checklist now on workforce and labor plans, and it’s heavily focused toward both the use of Registered Apprenticeship and ways to expand diversity within Registered Apprenticeship. I also wanted to mention one program where we had the opportunity to actually set some standards, which I think is a really important precedent, and that’s in EV charging. We have a proposed rule that soon will be finalized in which we require a registered electrical apprentice on every single EV charging project. The final thing I would bring up is within transit, which is the only area in the infrastructure law where we have dedicated funding for workforce development, to prevent displacement of transit workers as transit agencies are moving into zero emission fleets by helping workings be trained on new buses and other vehicles, and we have a heavy focus on Registered Apprenticeship in that program as well. We’re also really happy to be working with DOL on technical assistance for some of our grantees and potential grantees around Registered Apprenticeship, specifically diversity in Registered Apprenticeship.

***Sommars:*** I am in the field policy and management office at Housing and Urban Development, and I’m very excited to share that we have been working on a project in partnership with Energy on their weatherization efforts using funds from the infrastructure law and their annual funding. Weatherization is typically more of a pre-apprenticeship approach, but we have been working with them to target HUD residents and target those recruitment efforts into HUD communities. I primarily work on our labor policy of when we have HUD-funded projects, they are to hire and work with businesses that hire workers from those communities and YouthBuild participants, however we don’t really have funding for that, so we’ve been looking for partners to really help build up that workforce, and Energy has been a fantastic partner in that space. We are able to help them meet some of their weatherization goals while also improving economic opportunities for HUD residents and getting them on a pathway for green construction. We are rolling it out into a few HUD communities later this month and we hope to roll it out into all of our HUD communities throughout the next year or so.

***Peterson:*** One of the things that you all talked about was marketing campaigns, and that relates to what I want to talk to you about at Energy. There’s growth in jobs from the CHIPS and Science Act, the infrastructure law, and the Inflation Reduction Act. What’s unique and exciting about the Inflation Reduction Act is that it has a huge number of production and tax credits with a labor bonus that increases the amount by five times for a number of those credits, and it’s tied to the prevailing wage, but it’s also tied to apprenticeship requirements. One, after 2023, 15% of the labor hours will need to be done by apprentices, and any contractor or subcontractor who employs four or more individuals to do this work will be required to have an apprentice. The idea that you would actually require a quantity of apprentices on the work and track that is really incredibly important and an amazing breakthrough in how we talk about and deliver funding. What I’m concerned about is both the growth in all of the jobs that are coming through all of this funding and the demand for apprenticeship, and the connection between people who will go after these tax credits and good apprenticeship programs – that is very much a focus of Energy right now. From our perspective in the loan programs office, with all of this work that’s coming, we see access to skilled labor as a risk to project success, and so we’re excited that we can really be pushing for existing and expanded apprenticeship as a way to be successful on these projects, and we look forward to partnering with all of you on the strategies you’re doing that will help expand knowledge about and access to apprenticeship.

*3:00 p.m. – 3:15 p.m. – Break*

*3:15 p.m. – 3:50 p.m.*

**OPEN DISCUSSION AND NEXT STEPS**

*Observations from the co-chairs*

***Ginsburg***: First observation is how rich the conversation has been! It’s been a thought-provoking learning journey; thanks to everyone for the contributions! From the Modernization group, the flexibilities you were laying out are important. Not because it makes it easier, but it makes it adaptable to the changing business environment. Flexibilities that maintain quality and allow new industries to engage. Second, we need to work on the definition of youth apprenticeship, I think the age range we have today is too broad. Third, when you talk about pathways, it may not be clear enough actually what that means as it relates to apprenticeship and how that integrates in, for example expanding stackable apprenticeships in health care.

***Oliveira-Rivera***: Thanks all for contributions today. Underscore the need for data, analyzing the existing data, and looking at it at different ways than we have in the past. All different factors converging that were not part of previous ACA experiences. This creates a huge amount of opportunity that can only be leveraged through connections. Federal agencies and other public sector agencies are doing great work but not a lot of coordination between them. We should think about when we have a nomenclature that we all subscribe to that this should become a standard across all federal agencies. When looking at funding and looking at the ways registered apprenticeship is being factored into the funding opportunities and impacted by allocation decisions, we’re hoping that there’s uniformity and some level of consistency.

***Eddinger:*** Our job as leadership is to set the tone and parameters for what needs to be done and then ask the experts who are in the implementation and operational world to make doing the right thing come to fruition.

***Wolfe:*** Concerned that in the spirit of trying to have one voice, the nuance of the arguments is lost.

***Eddinger:*** Safeguard for that is that the subcommittees will be the ones deciding the language.

***Ladd***: Issue report template has been sent out to meeting members. Added section at end, if there are elements that you think require regulatory change, flag those in issue papers. Next meeting in California in March. Subcommittees will be meeting before then. For March meeting, hope is that subcommittees would have drafts or something high level for the finalized topics for the committee to look at and provide feedback on. For May meeting, finalize papers based on feedback. Final report due May 19th.

Two processes that relate to the committee: (1) charter that governs and authorizes the committee has to be reauthorized in the spring (don’t anticipate major changes); (2) membership process as well. Another call for ACA membership. Membership terms expire in September.

From the interim report, 133/145 recommendations can move forward. The main reasons that recommendations weren’t accepted were generally that we didn’t have the regulatory authority to do that. OA adding staff like never before. New data dashboard unveiled during National Apprenticeship Week – not just static data, but it is customizable in displaying the data how you want to see it displayed.

***Laney:*** Regarding that data dashboard, not 100% reflective of what we’d like to see displayed to the general public without being contextualized in any way. Need to fix this.

***Wolfe:*** Being in person was an unbelievably good experience. This meeting was a leap forward in group development and group trust and interaction. Meeting captured attention the whole day. Sorry I wasn’t able to be at the site visits.

***Scott:*** Thought panelists were excellent. Want to see more of that in future.

***Kardel:*** Thanks to Noel and his team for making this happen.

***Lenhoff:*** Wish I was there in person. Looking forward to being at the next meeting in person. Congratulations to John for hiring all this new staff. I like the new data dashboard despite that there might be some glitches with it; it’s what the public needs. Will strategic statements be added to each of the subcommittee’s sections of the interim report for the March meeting, and then the interim report all wrapped up together for the May report?

***Ladd:*** Not exactly, idea was that all of the strategic framework statements go at the beginning of the report to give a set of principles through which all other recommendations should be viewed.

***Eddinger:*** Can certainly agendize stuff for next meeting to go through it in greater detail as folks develop a fuller understanding of what their issue papers will look like.

***Oathout:*** Think format was great and was great to see successful programs. A lot of work behind the scenes and everybody did a great job.

***Eddinger:*** I’ll ask the Assistant Secretary to sign us off.

*3:50 – 4:00*

**MEETING WRAP UP**

***Parton:*** Round of applause for Chair Dr. Pam Eddinger and Kenya Huckaby. Thanks for all perspectives. Format led to great conversation. Seeing something together creates a shared fact basis. Format frames up really well with what this committee came to do, such as answering questions if there is space in our registered apprenticeship system for this type of experience. We’re all here for the same reason and a huge thank you to all.

**CERTIFICATION**

As the Chairperson of the Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship, I hereby certify the accuracy of the January 12, 2023 ACA Meeting Minutes.



\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Dr. Pam Eddinger

ACA Chairperson