



# **Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship Meeting**

**October 6, 2021**

*Executive Summary and Meeting Minutes*



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

### ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON APPRENTICESHIP (ACA)

#### Executive Summary

The Advisory Committee Meeting on Apprenticeship (ACA) is a discretionary committee reestablished by the Secretary of Labor on May 4, 2021, following the President's February 17, 2021, statement on bolstering Registered Apprenticeships in which he highlighted the importance of the workers voice and encouraged the Department of Labor to *reinstate a National committee focused on apprenticeships*. This was the first public meeting of the ACA and provided a forum for ACA members to describe their vision for the role of the ACA, for current apprentice program participants to provide their perspectives, and for an overview of the five proposed subcommittees for which ACA members can volunteer in the upcoming months.

Moderator: Dr. Pam Eddinger, ACA Chairperson

Speakers: Secretary Martin J. Walsh, Acting Assistant Secretary, Employment and Training Administration, Angela Hanks, John V. Ladd, Amber Gillard, Christopher Borja, Andrew Ridgeway, Julie Wong, Cierra Mitchell, Megan Baird, & Michael Qualter

#### Meeting Highlights:

- **Dr. Pam Eddinger** introduced ACA committee members and moderated the session.
- **Departmental Remarks: Secretary Martin J. Walsh** and **Acting Assistant Secretary Angela Hanks** provided their support and vision for the ACA including its past successes and future potential for growth.
- **Youth Apprentices: Amber Gillard** and **Christopher Borja** shared their experiences as participants in the apprenticeship program as high school students.
- **John V. Ladd** provided a road map for ACA committee work ahead, background on the growth and evolution of Registered Apprenticeship, and an overview of previous ACA committee work.
- **ACA Subcommittees: Andrew Ridgeway, Julie Wong, Cierra Mitchell, Megan Baird,** and **Michael Qualter** provided an overview of each subcommittee they will facilitate at future meetings:
  - Apprenticeship Modernization
  - Increasing Equity, Diversity, Inclusion and Accessibility in Apprenticeship
  - Industry Engagement in New and Emerging Sectors
  - Apprenticeship Pathways: Pre-Apprenticeship, Youth Apprenticeship, and Degree Apprenticeships
  - Ex Officio Federal Workgroup



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

### ADVISORY COMMITTEE ON APPRENTICESHIP (ACA)

#### Meeting Minutes

Location: Virtual ([WorkforceGPS](#))

Date: October 6, 2021

Time: 3:30 – 5:00 p.m., Eastern Time

*3:30 p.m. – 3:50 p.m.*

#### **CALL TO ORDER, MEMBER ROLL CALL, AND AGENDA OVERVIEW:**

Laura Casertano, Consultant from the American Institutes for Research ([AIR](#)) Team opened the call and communicated to the meeting participants that the meeting slides and transcript will be available on WorkforceGPS within three business days, and asked participants to reach out to her with any questions.

**Mr. John Ladd, Administrator for the Office of Apprenticeship** introduced himself, noting his role at the Department of Labor as the Designated Federal Official for the reconstituted Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA). Mr. Ladd then introduced the ACA Chairperson, Dr. Pam Eddinger.

**Dr. Eddinger** introduced herself and officially called the meeting to order. Dr. Eddinger conducted a roll call of the ACA members, requesting that each member introduce themselves and their organizations and provide their preferred pronouns if desired.

#### **MEMBER ROLL CALL – PUBLIC REPRESENTATIVES:**

- (Delegate for Mr. Johnathan Adelstein, Wireless Infrastructure Association; delegate not identified)
- Intertech Plastics: Noel Ginsburg, CEO
- Computer Technology Industry Association (CompTIA): Amy Kardel, VP
- The Manufacturing Institute: Carolyn Lee, Executive Director
- National Electrical Contractors Association: David Long, CEO
- IBM: Obed Louissaint, Senior Vice President of Transformation and Culture (pronouns he, his, him)
- American Hotel and Lodging Foundation: Cary Alexander on behalf of Rosanna Maietta, President and CEO (she, her)



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

- The Hartford: Karmela Malone, Senior VP (she, her)
- Independent Electrical Contractors: Timothy Oberg, Assistant Director (he, him)
- Prisma Health: Valerie Richardson, Director of Talent and Workforce Development (she, her)
- United Association of Journeymen and Pipefitting Industry: Raymond Boyd, Assistant Director of Education and Training (he, him)
- Service Employees International Union: Daniel Bustillo, Executive Director of the Healthcare Career Advancement Program (he, him, his)
- Amalgamated Transit Union AFL-CIO/CLC: John A. Costa, International President
- American Federation of State County and Municipal Employees District 1199J: Stephanie Harris-Kuiper, Executive Director, Training and Development Fund
- Carpenters International Training Fund: William K. Irwin Jr., Executive Director (retired). Consultant
- International Association of Machinists and Aerospace Workers: Michael C. Oathout, Director, Occupation, Safety & Health and Apprenticeship (he, him)
- Ironworkers International: Vicki L. O'Leary, General Organizer and Director of Diversity (she, her)
- Laborer's International Union of North America: Bernadette Oliveira-Rivera, Assistant Executive Director for Training (she, her)
- International Union of Painters and Allied Trades: Anton P. Ruesing, Executive Director, International Finishing Trades Institute
- Electrical Training ALLIANCE: Todd W. Stafford, Executive Director (he, him)
- American Association of Community Colleges: Walter G. Bumphus, President and CEO (he, him)
- Jobs with Justice: Erin E. Johansson, Research Director (she, her)
- Wisconsin Department of Workforce Development: Joshua Johnson, Apprenticeship Director (also representing National Association of State and Territorial Apprenticeship Directors (NASTAD))
- Donna Lenhoff Associates: Donna Lenhoff, Principal (representing Chicago Women in the Trades) (she, her)
- Tennessee State University, Smart Global Technology Innovation Center: Robbie Melton, Associate Vice President (she, her)
- National Urban League: Traci R. Scott, Vice President of Workforce Development (she, her)



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

- San Francisco Office of Economic & Workforce Development: Orrian Willis, Senior Workforce Development Specialist (he, his, him)
- Early Care and Education Pathways to Success: Randi Beth Wolfe, Executive Director (she, her)

### **MEMBER ROLL CALL – EX OFFICIO REPRESENTATIVES:**

- U.S. Department of Commerce: Kevin Gallagher, Senior Advisor to Commerce Secretary Gina Raimondo (he, him)
- U.S. Department of Education (DOE): Amy Lloyd, Senior Advisor to Education Secretary Miguel Cardona
- U.S. Department of Energy: delegate to be named
- U.S. Department of Health and Human Services: Michael Culpepper, acting Chief Human Capital Officer, representing Secretary Xavier Becerra
- U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development: Joe Carlile, Senior Advisor to the Secretary on Budget Policy and Program
- U.S. Department of Transportation: Michael Shapiro, Deputy Assistant Secretary for Economic Policy

*3:50 p.m. – 4:20 p.m.*

**Dr. Eddinger** gave an overview of the meeting agenda, referring to upcoming remarks from Acting Assistant Secretary Angela Hanks and Secretary of Labor, Martin Walsh, input from two current youth apprentices, a roadmap for the ACA going forward, the subcommittees and the guiding questions prepared for those subcommittees, and a concluding discussion of next steps. Dr. Eddinger also mentioned that there would be an opportunity for Public Comment if needed, and remarked that the Committee's obligation is to be transparent and open.

**Acting Assistant Secretary Angela Hanks** offered sincere thanks to the Secretary of Labor and to the Office of Apprenticeship for reestablishing the ACA. Acting Assistant Secretary Hanks discussed the value of apprenticeship, the opportunity to leverage apprenticeships to achieve an equitable economic recovery, and the importance of the ACA for this effort. Acting Assistant Secretary Hanks then turned the call over to Secretary Walsh.

**Secretary Walsh** thanked the ACA members and described his previous interactions with Dr. Eddinger in her career, remarking that she is the "right person" to chair the ACA. Secretary Walsh discussed his background creating apprenticeships and workforce learning opportunities during his career, including as Mayor of Boston, Massachusetts, and said it was clear that



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

apprenticeship works. Secretary Walsh expressed that the expertise of the ACA will benefit the effort to expand and modernize apprenticeship. He stated that apprenticeship programs have plenty of data supporting the positive impact for employers and apprentices, they provide participants with in-demand skills while they earn a wage, give workers the opportunity to be surrounded by people and resources that contribute to their success, and that apprentices emerge from apprenticeships with skills, credentials, and a good job in hand.

The Secretary also discussed the Biden Administration's priorities with respect to workforce training, equitable economic recovery, and apprenticeship. He remarked that President Biden values apprenticeship and considers it a key strategy to "Building Back Better" and reaffirmed his commitment to expand apprenticeships early in his Administration, including reestablishing the ACA after a four-year dormancy. Secretary Walsh said he was excited to contribute to this effort, including by reinstating the ACA, early in his tenure as Secretary of the Department of Labor.

Secretary Walsh offered his vision and charge to the ACA, and asked the ACA members to provide him with recommendations to grow and strengthen apprenticeship in a short amount of time, including expanding, mobilizing, and diversifying the Registered Apprenticeship system. Secretary Walsh then talked about the current state of opportunity in the U.S. – employers are looking for workers, workers are looking for jobs, and we should aim to "seize the future." Secretary Walsh spoke of the need to expand apprenticeships to new communities, including underserved communities, and to expand apprenticeship into new industries Secretary Walsh discussed the importance of aligning apprenticeships with education programs, community development programs, and youth organizations to connect youth to opportunities. Secretary Walsh said he has traveled around the country to talk to young people, including young jobseekers, about their vision for their careers, and stated that the ACA's work should be inspired by those voices and ensure that apprentices are included at every ACA meeting to hear their perspectives. At the end of the day, the Secretary remarked that modernizing apprenticeship is about providing opportunities and opening doors.

***Acting Assistant Secretary Angela Hanks*** thanked Secretary Walsh and Dr. Eddinger for their leadership, along with the ACA members and the Office of Apprenticeship, and then she shared a few introductory words about the ACA. She said the current administration considers Registered Apprenticeship essential to its workforce agenda and our continued economic recovery. We are focused on delivering job quality, ensuring equity, and investing in workforce models that work - Registered Apprenticeship ticks these boxes. She referenced the President's [Executive Order on Strengthening Registered Apprenticeships](#) that established this Committee



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

and stated that apprenticeship is a centerpiece of the Administration's priorities for increasing job opportunities in the U.S., particularly for underserved populations. The Administration wants to address equity and build a system that will reach more workers and be inclusive. This Committee is ideally positioned to address these issues.

Ms. Hanks then introduced Amber Gillard, a pharmacy technician apprentice, who spoke to the group about her apprenticeship experiences.

**Ms. Amber Gillard:** I first connected with my apprenticeship after I saw a poster in my high school classroom about being paid to learn and work and worked with my science teacher and guidance counselor to find out more about the opportunity. I was told this was a free program with a paid 2-year internship and free classes. Taking college-level courses during high school was a challenge at first, but I ended up doing well in the courses and I had great help from people. Along with these courses, I had an internship – my resume was then sent to the apprenticeship team along to employers, and I was connected with a job in a hospital. To date, I have had a wide range of experiences in the hospital and am thankful for this.

I want to point out that there was nothing my apprenticeship sponsor wasn't willing to do for me, and I was appreciative of that. Taking up this workload while in high school was a challenge, but my apprenticeship program helped me through it at every step along the way. Participating in the apprenticeship program was one of the best decisions I've made, because it helped me figure out what to do with my career. The program was also a boost to my resume.

Ms. Gillard then introduced Christopher Borja, an electrician's apprentice.

**Mr. Christopher Borja:** I'm in my second year of an electrician's apprenticeship. Similar to Amber, I discovered the opportunity during junior year of high school and started the program senior year. It was an affordable opportunity, and I was drawn into the opportunity in part because of the 'hands-on' aspect. Currently, I'm working at a local high school in Maryland, and have been exposed to a range of opportunities. I've learned a lot working with the mechanics and master electricians, much more than just sitting in a classroom, and my high school even asked me to talk to other students about the opportunity. When talking with others, I realized that while many may not have considered apprenticeships previously, the idea seemed to be an appealing model to students, especially for those who don't want to sit in a classroom eight hours a day. Many students may not think of apprenticeship while attending college preparatory high schools, but when they learn about it, they become interested. I'm working and productive straight out of high school and am grateful for the opportunity.



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

4:20 p.m. – 4:30 p.m.

Dr. Eddinger thanked the apprentices for sharing their perspectives.

**Dr. Eddinger:** We want more apprenticeships in the contemporary and emerging fields, we want to build on the solid foundation of apprenticeship knowledge from trade sectors, and we want to enable a just and equitable economic recovery and growth. Apprenticeships must come with a pathway for advancement and good for our communities of color and lifting our communities from poverty.

**Mr. Ladd:** This has been a fantastic start to the ACA. He expressed gratitude that the Committee was able to hear from Secretary Walsh, Acting Assistant Secretary Hanks, and youth apprentices. Mr. Ladd stated that the next focus is determining the mechanics of how the ACA is going to get things done.

Mr. Ladd provided a roadmap of the work ahead, including the ACA subcommittees and how they will influence the development of a report to the Secretary. Mr. Ladd provided an overview of the growth and evolution of the National apprenticeship system, referring to important legislative developments (some of which still exist/are relevant today) throughout U.S. history, and the history of Federal investments in Registered Apprenticeships. Mr. Ladd pointed out that prior to 2015, there was no Federal investment (just State-level investments) in Registered Apprenticeship. He stated that investments from the Federal level beginning in 2015 fueled the growth we are experiencing today in apprenticeship. Mr. Ladd suggested that further growth in apprenticeship is a priority of the Administration, with President Biden calling to add 1-2 million apprenticeship slots over the next ten years.

Mr. Ladd then provided an overview of the ACA, including its history, statutory authorization, its status as a Federal Advisory Committee (subject to the Federal Advisory Committee Act), and its current charter. The charter instructs the Committee to develop an interim report within 6 months with recommendations to expand and modernize apprenticeship. Mr. Ladd shared examples of previous reports developed by prior versions of the ACA – these reports range from broad overviews to targeted recommendations on specific issues. Mr. Ladd pointed out the links at the bottom of the slide connecting members with a landing page on Apprenticeship.gov with additional resources members should peruse.

Next, Mr. Ladd discussed the high-level timeline for the ACA, including two additional full ACA meetings (likely in January and May) in order to deliver an interim report in six months. In between these full meetings, significant work will be happening at the subcommittee level. To



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

meet the six-month goal, Mr. Ladd suggested the subcommittees begin work immediately, and the full ACA will review developed recommendations at the second meeting. By the third meeting, the ACA will deliberate and finalize the report.

Finally, Mr. Ladd described the four proposed subcommittees envisioned by OA, which ACA members will “select,” as well as the Ex Officio Federal Workgroup. The subcommittees are:

- Apprenticeship Modernization (Andrew Ridgeway)
- Increasing Equity, Diversity, Inclusion, and Accessibility in Apprenticeship (Julie Wong)
- Industry Engagement in New and Emerging Sectors (Cierra Mitchell)
- Apprenticeship Pathways: Pre-Apprenticeship, Youth Apprenticeship, and Degree Apprenticeships (Megan Baird)
- Ex Officio Federal Workgroup (Michael Qualter)

*4:30 p.m. – 4:45 p.m.*

### **APPRENTICESHIP MODERNIZATION SUBCOMMITTEE**

**Mr. Andy Ridgeway** thanked the group and provided an overview of the first subcommittee on Apprenticeship Modernization. This subcommittee will “build out and upon” the high quality trademarks within apprenticeship. We want to build upon the successful 80-year history, take what’s pivotal and working, and expand this model to other industries and sectors in an equitable fashion. Look at this subcommittee from a “system building” approach – how do we bring in stakeholders to build a more cohesive system? How can we leverage technology and data to support apprenticeship modernization? How do we ensure the quality of the data to make a strong case for apprenticeship’s effectiveness as a workforce development solution?

**Dr. Eddinger:** As we go through subcommittee descriptions, keep in mind that we will want you to rank your top three choices. In addition, please think about the questions we have posed – are these the correct questions? Are there any missing questions? We would love to capture your feedback about these subcommittee guiding questions.

**Mr. Obed Louissaint:** These are good questions and a good focus area – what about the ability to use technology to source individuals with tangent skills to apprenticeships? Enabling us to cast a broader net on the population of interest.



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

**Ms. Donna Lenhoff:** The question about data could be expanded – not just demonstrate the power of apprenticeship but it can also help to direct where apprenticeship could go; what industries already have diversity and equity for instance. There is a wealth of data here and we can use it to both describe the effectiveness of apprenticeship and provide future direction.

**Ms. Amy Kardell:** Modernizing also has to do with the employer's mindset – employers, particularly those in tech, could use more support in developing apprenticeships and attracting apprentices. Industries not traditionally in the apprenticeship role cannot be over-communicated with around the advantages of apprentices.

### **INCREASING EQUITY, DIVERSITY, INCLUSION, AND ACCESSIBILITY IN APPRENTICESHIP SUBCOMMITTEE**

**Ms. Julie Wong:** The need by this subcommittee is great. We know that apprenticeships are a key strategy in developing a skilled and competitive workforce, and we are looking to embed diversity and inclusion strategies within apprenticeship programs. The subcommittee will focus on enabling all workers to access apprenticeships and succeed within the system, will make change by investigating and highlighting models to improve diversity and inclusion, will support industries seeking to diversify their workforce, and will identify the most critical and impactful investments DOL can make to support diversity and inclusion in apprenticeship programs.

**Mr. Noel Ginsburg:** Consider adding a topic about increasing the 'fidelity' of apprenticeships so that it is looked at as equal to a four-year degree. Mr. Ginsburg discussed a recent example where a student said anything short of a full four-year degree is a "failure." We need educate businesses, parents, students, etc. to establish dignity around apprenticeship to be able to scale it up...some of our diverse youth apprentices, including people of color are earning \$45,000 to \$70,000 at the beginning of their careers and we need to communicate this.

**Mr. Raymond Boyd:** Questions are "spot on." He noted that with building trades, apprenticeships have been the "best kept secret" and referred to Amber's discovery of a poster in her classroom as a method of educating. It's important to stop being a "best kept secret" - we must start educating in middle school and make efforts to expand into communities where target populations (such as women or people of color) actually are and then share the opportunities and the message.

### **INDUSTRY ENGAGEMENT IN NEW AND EMERGING SECTORS SUBCOMMITTEE**



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

**Ms. Cierra Mitchell:** Industry engagement is critical for the growth and success of Registered Apprenticeship. This subcommittee will help develop innovative strategies to increase labor engagement in new and emerging sectors. We want to understand what has worked to expand apprenticeships, how to reach out to new sectors or regions, how to leverage joint labor-management partnerships, and how DOL can support the effort to expand apprenticeships into new sectors and with new businesses and employers.

**Mr. Daniel Bustillo:** I appreciate the questions – consider that there are important sector-specific differences. It's also important to think about occupational segregation that is particularly endemic in certain sectors.

**Ms. Valerie Richardson:** Businesses need more information regarding how to engage with or begin an apprenticeship – whom do I reach out to? Is there something established? Are there resources or lessons to draw on to allow this process to move quickly for a new company?

**Mr. Obed Louissaint:** Streamline the onramp for new companies and industries. Be selective in identifying key job roles – what jobs will create the greatest growth and wealth opportunity? Establish standards around the skills/micro-credentials where necessary, ensuring that credentials are portable so apprentices can transfer between jobs without starting over.

### **APPRENTICESHIP PATHWAYS: PRE-APPRENTICESHIP, YOUTH APPRENTICESHIP, AND DEGREE APPRENTICESHIPS SUBCOMMITTEE**

**Ms. Megan Baird:** Guiding questions for this subcommittee: What is the appropriate role for DOL/State Apprenticeship Agencies to oversee youth apprenticeships and apprenticeship models? How can we promote quality in youth/pre-apprenticeships? How can we make apprenticeship a “mainstream” postsecondary option? How can we ensure that youth and pre-apprenticeship is recognized and valued by K-12, postsecondary education, etc.

**Mr. Noel Ginsburg:** For this to scale, businesses must understand this is not just “a good thing to do”...there is evidence that it strengthens businesses, makes them more competitive. Secondly, many programs have spent resources seeking to improve diversity, but may not have done this in the most efficient way. Youth apprenticeship has a high level of return on investment. Businesses respond to data.



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

**Ms. Valerie Richardson:** Connect dots with Career Tech Ed and Career Pathways. In South Carolina, we're reviewing stackable certificates and how valuable they are, how they can be used to connect education and business engagement.

**Mr. Timothy Oberg:** I think reaching out to youths during high school is a great way to expand interest and awareness about apprenticeship. Talking with students, generating word of mouth from apprentices to family and friends, etc. is helpful to get people interested and signed up.

**Mr. Michael Oathout:** We have some experience with pre-apprenticeships and working with the high schools and have had great success speaking with students about pre-apprenticeship programs, helping them focus and engage.

### **EX OFFICIO FEDERAL WORKGROUP**

**Mr. Mike Qualter:** Representatives from across various Federal agencies will participate in this subcommittee. What policies could be developed or revised to support apprenticeship and how can federal partners provide guidance and leadership to make easier for state and local counterparts to partners to coordinate? Which workforce and career and technical education formula funding streams and discretionary grant programs could be leveraged for opportunities to support and/or incentivize apprenticeship adoption as well as to create more equitable career pathways? What procurement mechanisms are available that could be embedded in federal grants and contracts to support the goals for apprenticeship?

**Dr. Eddinger:** Very pleased to see the “wonderful web” of backgrounds and expertise present on the call. Called on Mr. Ladd to discuss the next steps.

**Mr. Ladd:** Quickly (out of respect for members' time) went through the next steps for the ACA, discussed guidelines and expectations related to the subcommittees (explaining that more info will be coming via email), and mentioned that while members can send one “designee” to the subcommittee, they cannot send more than one “designee” (in order to maintain balance in numbers by type of organization). Members should rank up to 3 subcommittees of interest, and the hope is that by the next ACA meeting, there will be report-outs from each subcommittee. Again, there will be a follow-up email with next steps and what will be delivered at the next meeting.

Any questions from members on process/next steps?



## Secretary's Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship (ACA)

**Dr. Eddinger:** For purposes of timing, OA staff should collect any unanswered questions and provide answers after the meeting.

**Mr. Ladd:** There were no requests for public comments at today's meeting. The Federal Register notice for each meeting has instructions on how to comment at that meeting.

**Dr. Eddinger:** Sincerely thank all the ACA members for your engagement and participation – it has started strongly! Thank you to Sec. Walsh for his inspirational work, to Asst. Sec. Hanks, and to Mr. Ladd. I'm grateful – I know we have important work to do, and I hope we always do it with joy. I will entertain a motion to adjourn.

**Mr. Obed Louissaint:** Moved to adjourn

**Mr. Joshua Johnson:** Second

**Dr. Eddinger:** Hearing several ayes, unanimous acceptance. You will hear from staff about next steps. Thank you and take care!



Secretary's Advisory Committee on  
Apprenticeship (ACA)

**CERTIFICATION**

As the Chairperson of the Advisory Committee on Apprenticeship, I hereby certify the accuracy of the October 2021 Summary Meeting Minutes.

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Pam Eddinger". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

---

Dr. Pam Eddinger  
ACA Chairperson